



AN OPEN SECRET

writer:

**ALLAMAH ABDUSSATTAR HAMDANI "MASROOF"
(BARKATEE, NOORIE)**

**English translation By
Dr. Amirul Haque
M.S. (Ophthalmology)**

Www.Markazahlesunnat.com

نَحْمَدُهُ وَنُصَلِّي عَلَى رَسُولِهِ الْكَرِيمِ
اللَّهُ رَبُّ مُحَمَّدٍ صَلَّى عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ
نَحْنُ عِبَادُ مُحَمَّدٍ صَلَّى عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ

Nowadays the members of Tableeghee Jama'at (Deobandee) are busy in propagating that the differences between Bareilvee Sun'nee and wahabee-Deobandee is nothing more than a personal feud between 'Ala Hazrat Imam Ahmad Raza Bareillvee (1856–1921 AD) and Maulana Ashraf 'Ali Thanvee (1863-1943 AD). They claim that 'Ala Hazrat and Maulana Ashraf 'Ali Thanvee had studied together in Darul 'Uloom Deoband and during their childhood they had quarreled. Subsequently 'Ala Hazrat in the fit of anger, he decreed the Thanvee and other Deobandee stalwarts as Kafir. According to them, 'Ala Hazrat then left the education incomplete and went to Barielly where till his last breath, he remained unhappy with Maulana Ashraf 'Ali Thanvee and others and stuck to his edict (fatawa) ¹.

¹ **Wahabee:** Mohammad ib'n-e 'Abdul Wahhab produced the heretic idea of Wahabee sect. He was born in 1115 AH (1703 AD) and died in 1206 AH (1792 AD). British hired him with the sole purpose of weakening the Islam. They (Wahabee sect) misinterpreted Qur'an Shareef in accordance with their own ideas and with basic intention to please British Government, their employer. In order to deceive Muslims (Ah'l-e sunnat), they said they were in Hambalee mazhab. However, most of the Hambalee scholars wrote books refuting them and explaining that they were heretics. They are disbelievers because they belittle prophets ﷺ and the auliya رضى الله تعالى عنهم.

The heretic Wahabee sect is based on following essentials:

1. Allah جل جلاله can lie (Allah forbid).
2. They interpret Qur'an Shareef according to their own understanding.
3. They say that the Prophet صلى الله تعالى عليه وآله وسلم was not a superhuman. He was a simple human being without any supernatural power. They reject the facts reported by Sahabah-e Kiram and scholars of Ah'l-e sunnat.
4. They say all non-Wahabees including persons who imitate one of the four mazhabs are disbelievers.

www.Markazahlesunnat.com

-
- 5.They say a person who prays by making the Holy prophet ﷺ and the auliya رضى الله تعالى عنهم intermediaries between himself and Allah جل جلاله will become a disbeliever.
 - 6.They say it is haram to visit prophet's ﷺ mausoleum or those of the auliya رضى الله تعالى عنهم.
 - 7.They reject the concept of Maulood (celebration of birthday of Huzoor-e Aqdas ﷺ, Fatihah (reading the Fatihah on certain fixed days after person's death seeking intercession for him or her with Allah جل جلاله) and nida-e ghair- Allah (calling upon one other than Allah جل جلاله for help). They say doer will become a disbeliever.

They (Wahabee) also call themselves as **Ah'l-e Hadith** or Non-conformist (**ghair-muqallid**) as they do not follow any imam from four mazhabs. As Mohammad ib'n-e 'Abdul Wahhab was from Najad, they are also known as **Naj'dee**.

Deobandee: A group of Indian Conformist (follow any one imam from four mazhabs) who believe in and follow views of Isma'eel Dehlavee (d. 1831 AD), Ashraf 'Ali Thanvee (1863-1943 AD), Rasheed Ahmad Gangohee (1829-1905 AD), Qaseem Nanotvee (1833-1879 AD) and Khaleel Ahmad Ambethvee. They also accept Mohammad ib'n-e Abdul Wahhab of Naj'd as their leader and hence they are also known as Wahabee.

The heretic Deobandee sect is based on following essentials:

01. Allah can tell a lie.
02. Allah does not know beforehand what His creations would do. Allah comes to know of their doings only after they have done something.
03. Shaitan (Satan) and the Angel of death are more knowledgeable than the Holy Prophet ﷺ is.
04. The kind of knowledge and the amount of knowledge of the unseen given by Allah Ta'ala to the Holy Prophet ﷺ has also been given to animals, lunatics and children.
05. Even the thought of the holy Prophet ﷺ occurring during namaz is much worse than to be immersed in the thought of an ox or a donkey.
06. To the common people, the expression "Khatim-un-Nabiy-yeen" means the "last Prophet". To the knowing people this is not a correct view. Even if a Prophet was to be born after the Holy Prophet ﷺ it would still have no effect on the concept of the finality of Mohammad ﷺ.
07. A follower apparently excels his Prophet in deeds.

The above allegation is mere deception of the fact and a white lie. History itself is witness to this fallacy. We will prove the fraud from the books authored by the scholars of the Deoband itself. We will consider following line of reasoning:

- Age difference
- Traditional studies and graduation
- Place of study
- Time of illustrious and authoritative literary work

1. Age difference :

‘Ala Hazrat Imam Ahmad Raza Bareillvee was 7 years 3 months and 5 days older than Maulvi Ashraf ‘Ali Thanvee.

Birth date of ‘Ala Hazrat:

‘Ala Hazrat Imam Ahmad Raza Bareillvee was born on 10th Shawwal 1272 AH (June 14, 1856 AD).

Maulvi Ahmad Raza sahib Bareilvee son of Maulvi Naqi Ali Khan Bareilvee, Rohilkhand, was born on the tenth day of the tenth month i.e. on Monday the 10th Shawwal, 1272 AH.²

Birth date of Maulvi Ashraf ‘Ali Thanvee:

Maulvi Ashraf ‘Ali Thanvee was born on the 5th day of Rabi-us-Sani, in the year 1280 AH (September 19, 1863). The authenticity of this birth date can be proved from below given references:

A chosen nominee of Maulvi Thanvee, Khwaja Azizul Hasan writes:

-
08. The Holy Prophet’s ﷺ wish for something to happen is of no consequence.
 09. Any Muslim who regards the Prophet or the friends of Allah to be Allah’s creations and bondsmen and yet makes them his advocates and intercessors, and gives nazr and niyaz equals Abu Jahl in apostasy.
 10. Meelad shareef, giyarhveen shareef, 'urs shareef, fatihah khawani, and ieesal-e-savab, all are unlawful and bad innovations and the ways of the infidel Hindus.

² Hayat-e-‘Ala Hazrat, by Hazrat Maulana Zafaruddin Bihari. Publisher: Qadri Book Depot, Bareilly. Volume I, Page 11.

Hazrat was born early in the morning of Thursday, the 5th Rabi-us-Sani, 1280 AH.³

Maulvi Ashraf 'Ali Thanvee himself says:

My year of birth is 1280 A.H. the 5th Rabi-us-Sani in the early morning.⁴

2. Traditional studies and graduation :

Imam Ahmad Raza:

Imam Ahmad Raza had acquired all his religious education from his father Hazrat 'Allamah Naqi Ali Khan (1831-1880 AD), Grand Father Hazrat Maulana Raza 'Ali Khan (1809-1866 AD) and Hazrat Maulana Mirza Ghulam 'Abdul Qadir Baig.

Imam Ahmad Raza's first teacher was Maulana Mirza Ghulam 'Abdul Qadir Baig⁵..... He later studied the dars-e nizamee under his father's direction. His father exerted an important intellectual influence on his thought in these formative years.⁶

Ala Hazrat had completed his traditional studies at the very young age of 13 years 10 months and 5 days. In the young age of just about 14 years (i.e. 1286 A.H.) he was awarded the degree of 'Mufti'. Maulana Zafaruddin Bihari describes as follows:

³ Ashrafus Sawaneh: by Khwaja Azizul Hasan, Publisher: Maktaba-e-Talifat-e-Ashrafiah, Thane Bhuvan. Vol. 1, Page 16.

⁴ Husn-al-Azeez by Khwaja Azizul Hasan. Published by Maktaba-e-Talifat-e-Ashrafiah, Thana Bhuvan, Muzaffarpur (U.P.) Vol. 1, Part 10, Page 18.

⁵ Opponents of Ahl-e Sunnat alleged that Maulana Mirza Ghulam 'Abdul Qadir Baig was brother of Mirza Gulam Ahmad, founder of the Ahmadee Movement. However, Maulana Mirza Ghulam 'Abdul Qadir Baig was resident of Bareilly who later moved to Kolkata. He had no connection with Ahmadee Movement.

⁶ Devotional Islam & Politics in British India, Ahmad Riza Khan Bareilwi and His Movement, 1870 - 1920 by Usha Sanyal: Oxford India Paperbacks 1999, P: 55.

All the traditional knowledge was gained by him, until the 14th Sha'aban 1286 A.H., through his father. On the very same day he issued a fatwa regarding Fosterage and presented it to his father. The explanations were absolutely correct and hence by judging the intellect and acumen of this child, his father encumbered him with the responsibility of issuing the fatawah.⁷

In the year 1286 A.H., When 'Ala Hazrat Imam Ahmad Raza Bareillvee had already become a Mufti and was busy in nurturing the Islamic world, Maulvi Ashraf 'Ali Thanvee was just 6 years old (as he was born in 1280 A.H.). Hence it is just inconceivable that 'Ala Hazrat and Maulvi Thanvee had earned their education together.

Maulvi Ashraf 'Ali Thanvee:

Maulvi Thanvee had been admitted into Darul-Uloom Deoband in the year 1295 A.H. when he was 15 years old.

He acquired the entire knowledge of Arabic in Deoband only and by the grace of Allah, had concluded his education by 19th or 20th year of his life, He studied in the Madarsa-e-Deoband for about 5 years, He was admitted in the Zeel-Qa'ad 1295 A.H. and at the beginning of the year 1301 A.H. he was already a learned scholar.⁸

This establishes that Imam Ahmad Raza had been accomplished his education and qualified as a learned scholar in the year 1286 A.H. whereas Maulvi Thanvee began his education 9 years later in 1295 A.H. Hence how is it possible that both 'Ala Hazrat Imam Ahmad Raza and Maulvi Ashraf 'Ali Thanvee were classmates at Deoband?

In the year 1301 A.H., Maulvi Thanvee was about 21 years old when he had concluded his studies. In this year Imam Ahmad Raza was about 28 years old and was glowing like

⁷ Hayat-e-'Ala Hazrat, by Hazrat Maulana Zafaruddin Bihari. Publisher: Qadri Book Depot, Bareilly. Volume 1, Page 11

⁸ Ashrafus Sawaneh, by: Khwaja Azizul Hasan, Publishers: Maktaba-e-Talifat-e-Ashrafiah, Thana Bhuvan, Vol. 1, Page 24, Chapter 2.

sun amid the known intellects of Islamic world. All the prodigies of Ummah had already accepted him as their Imam and approved him as a trendsetter. By this year he was already an author of more than 75 books.

In the year 1300 A.H., scholars from Badayun, Sambhal and Rampur had unanimously declared a debate with 'Ala Hazrat. ... By this time he already had written 75 books.⁹

In a nutshell, while Maulvi Thanvee was just emerging out of the school, Imam Ahmad Raza had already been established as a scholar, author, intellectual and philosopher in the then Islamic world. Hence to suggest that Maulvi Ashraf 'Ali Thanvee and 'Ala Hazrat Imam Ahmad Raza Bareillvee were schoolmates is nothing but a blatant falsehood which requires to be fended with extreme severity.

3. Place of study:

Imam Ahmad Raza studied at Bareilly:

The biographical references to 'Ala Hazrat Imam Ahmad Raza's scholarly abilities make the point that much of his knowledge was self-taught.¹⁰ On the basis of biographical studies Usha Sanyal agrees with Maulana Zafaruddin Bihari:

We know little about Ahmad Riza's teachers other than his father and grandfather. He had a few other teachers as well, notably Maulana Abu'l Husain 'Nuri Miyan' Maraharwi. But unlike many others in his day, He had no madrasa education.¹¹

⁹ Hayat-e-'Ala Hazrat, by Hazrat Maulana Zafaruddin Bihari. Published by Qadri Book Depot. Vol. 1, Pages 12 & 13.

¹⁰ Hayat-e-'Ala Hazrat, by Hazrat Maulana Zafaruddin Bihari. Publisher: Qadri Book Depot, Bareilly. Volume 1, Page 35.

¹¹ Devotional Islam & Politics in British India, Ahmad Riza Khan Bareilwi and His Movement, 1870 – 1920 by Usha Sanyal: Oxford India Paperbacks 1999, P: 56

Maulvi Ashraf ‘Ali Thanvee studied at Deoband:

Maulvi Ashraf ‘Ali Thanvee studied at the Deoband Seminary (Darul Uloom Deoband¹²) from 1295 to 1301 AH (1878 -1884 AD).¹³ Among his teachers were Maulana Muhammad Qasim Nanotavee, Maulana Rasheed Ahmad Gangohi, Maulana Muhammad Yaqub Nanotavee, and Maulana Mehmoodul Hasan. Maulvi Ashraf ‘Ali Thanvee did not have many opportunities to study under the founder of the Deoband Seminary, Maulana Qasim Nanotavee, whose last year was Maulana Thanavee’s first year at Deoband.

4. Time of illustrious and authoritative literary work:

Literary works of Imam Ahmad Raza up to 1295 A.H.:

Here is a short list of the books transcribed by ‘Ala Hazrat Imam Ahmad Raza Bareillvee up to the year 1295 A.H.:

01. *Sharahe Hadayatal Nahu (Arabic) – 1280 A.H.*
02. *Hashiyah Muslim Alsaboot (Arabic) – 1282 A.H.*
03. *Dhau-un-Nihayah fi Elamil Hamde Wal Hidayah (Arabic) - 1285 A.H.*
04. *Hal Khataul Khat – 1288 A.H.*
05. *As Sai-il Mashkoor fi Abdaa-il Haqqil Mahjoor (Arabic) – 1290 A.H.*
06. *Jawab Hai Turki ba Turki – 1292 A.H.*
07. *Tanbihul Jehal ba Ilhamul Baasitul Muta'al – 1292 A.H.*
08. *Ya'abaraal Talib fi shaiwan-e-abi Talib (Urdu) – 1294 A.H.*
09. *Martajiul Ijabaat Li Du'al Amwat (Urdu) – 1294 A.H.*
10. *Niqa'un Nayyara Fi sharhal Jawhara Mulaqqab Bihin Naira (Urdu) – 1295 A.H.*
11. *Al Tartur Radiyya alan Nairatul Vadhiyah (Arabic) – 1295 A.H.*
12. *An Nairatul Radia Alan Nairatul Wadia – 1295 A.H.*

¹² The foundation stone was laid in the land of Deoband on the day of Thursday, 15th Muharram, 1283 AH (May 30, 1866).

¹³ Ashrafus Sawaneh, by: Khwaja Azizul Hasan, Publishers: Maktaba-e-Talifat-e-Ashrafiah, Thana Bhuvan, Vol. 1, Page 24, Chapter 2

It should be noted that aforementioned list of 12 books were authored and transcribed by 'Ala Hazrat Imam Ahmad Raza Bareillvee before Maulvi Thanvee began his education in the Madarsa-e-Deoband in 1295 A.H.

For ready reference, here is a short list of the books transcribed by 'Ala Hazrat Imam Ahmad Raza Bareillvee from 1295 to 1301 A.H.:

- 01 *Qamrut Tamam fi Naifuz zil an Sayyedil Ana'am* – 1296 A.H.
- 02 *Noor-e-A'inee fil Intisarul Imam A'inee (Arabic)* – 1296 A.H.
- 03 *Nafihul Fai Aman be Noorih Anar Kul Shai (Urdu)*- 1296 A.H.
- 04 *Al Najmu Sawaqib fi Takhreeje Ahadisil Kawakib (Arabic)* – 1296 A.H.
- 05 *Alrauzul Bahij fi Aadabit Takhreej (Arabic)* – 1296 A.H.
- 06 *Matlail Qamarain fi Ehanate Sabaqatil Amrain (Urdu)* – 1297 A.H.
- 07 *Al Kalamul Bahi fi Tasbeehus Siddique bin Nabi (Urdu)* – 1297 A.H.
- 08 *Wajhul Mashqooq bi Jalwat Asmahus Siddique wa Farooque (Urdu)* – 1297 A.H.
- 09 *Saltanatul Mustafa fi Malakoot Kul-Lul Wara (Urdu)* – 1297 A.H.
- 10 *Ajlal-e-Jibraeel be Ja'lati Khadiman lil Mehboobul Jaleel (Urdu)* – 1298 A.H.
- 11 *Aitaqadul Ijtenab fil Jameele wal Mustafa wal Aala wal Ashab (Urdu)* - 1298 A.H.
- 12 *Ahkamul Ahkam Fith Tanawil Maiin Yad mim Malid Haram (Urdu)* – 1298 A.H.
- 13 *Anfasul Fakr fi Qurbanul Baqr (Urdu)* – 1298 A.H.
- 14 *Al Amr ba Ahtaramul Maqabir (Urdu)* – 1298 A.H.
- 15 *Aqaamatul Qayama A'ala Ta'anil Qayamle Nabiye Tahamah (Urdu)* – 1298 A.H.
- 16 *Al Tarazul Mazhab Fit Tawzeej Beshairil Kafu wa Mukhaliful Mazhab –(Urdu)* – 1298 A.H.
- 17 *Fahsnul Bara'afi Tanfiz Hukmul Jama'ah (Arabic)* – 1299 A.H.
- 18 *Al Naeemul Haqem fi Farhate Maulidun Nabiyil Kareem (Urdu)*– 1299 A.H.
- 19 *Fashul Qaza Fi Rasmul Ifta'a (Arabic)* – 1299 A.H.
- 20 *Abqari Hisan fi Ljabatil Azaaz (Arabic)* – 1299 A.H.
- 21 *Saiful Mustafa A'ala Adyanul Iftra (Urdu)* – 1299 A.H.

- 22 *Hudil Hairan fi Nafiul fai A'nish Shamsul Akwaan (Urdu) – 1299 A.H.*
- 23 *Al Joharus Sameen fima Tanaqad Bihil Yameen (Arabic) – 1299 A.H.*
- 24 *Al Bashari'ul 'Ajilah man tahfe A'ajilah. (Arabic) – 1300 A.H.*
- 25 *Bazlus Safa'ale Abdil Mustafa (Urdu) – 1300 A.H.*
- 26 *Sawariqun Nisa fi Hadil Misrul Fana (Arabic) – 1300 A.H.*
- 27 *Lamatush Shama'a fi Isharatul Misr Liljuma'a (Arabic) – 1300 A.H.*
- 28 *Al Raihatul Ambia Anil Jamratul Huderia – 1300 A.H.*
- 29 *Ashamed Jalwa fi Tehqeequl Mil Wal Zara Farasikh Wal Ghalwa (Arabic) – 1300 A.H.*
- 30 *Al As-alatul Fazila Alat Tawaiful Ba'atila (Urdu) – 1300 A.H.*
- 31 *Fateh Khaibar (Urdu) – 1300 A.H.*
- 32 *Hamaed Fazl-e-Rasool (Arabic) – 1300 A.H.*
- 33 *Maddahe Fazl-e-Rasool (Arabic) – 1300 A.H.*
- 34 *Nazare Sada dar Tahinate Shadi Asrai (Urdu) – 1300 A.H.*
- 35 *Az Zalal Alnaqi man Bahre Sabqatul Atqi (Arabic) – 1300 A.H.*
- 36 *Al Maqalahul Musfera an Ahkamul Bidatul Mukaffira (Arabic) – 1301 A.H.*
- 37 *Al Mujammul Madad un Saabul Mustafa Murtab (Arabic) – 1301 A.H.*

By the year 1301 A.H., 'Ala Hazrat Imam Ahmad Raza Bareillvee had written several marginal notes, commentaries and fatawa in addition to the above mentioned books. Besides all these scholastic works, the fatawas issued up to 1301 A.H. are spread in 12 volumes of Fatawa Razaviyyah itself and this amount of labour is only the tip of the iceberg. This stands to mean that 'Ala Hazrat Imam Ahmad Raza Bareillvee had already earned a name in the Islamic world as a vast ocean of knowledge while Maulvi Ashraf 'Ali Thanvee was still just a student. Under these circumstances, the assertion that Maulvi Ashraf 'Ali Thanvee was the classmate of Imam Ahmad Raza tantamount to holding a mirror to the sun.

Literary works of Maulvi Ashraf 'Ali Thanvee:

In the year 1286 A.H. 'Ala Hazrat Imam Ahmad Raza Bareillvee had attained the status of Mufti. It was then that Maulvi Ashraf 'Ali Thanvee lost his mother when he was hardly five years old. After the demise of his mother, he was taken care of by his father.

He was hardly five years old when his benevolent mother passed away.¹⁴

After the death of his mother, Maulvi Ashraf 'Ali Thanvee Stayed under the care of his father from 1285 A.H. to 1295 A.H. till his admission to Darul-uloom Deoband. During this period (almost a decade) of childhood Maulvi Ashraf 'Ali Thanvee often engaged in such mischievous activities which are sufficient for anyone to feel ashamed. His notoriety can be measured by some of the incidents described in his biography as under:

- Fastening of the legs of Charpoy of his father
- Urination on his brother's head
- Laughing loudly, deceiving Hafizji and breaking the namaz
- Throwing the shoes of worshipers on the mandap of the mosque
- Placing a puppy in the plate of his uncle

1. Fastening of the legs of Charpoy of his father:

In his discourses, Maulvi Ashraf 'Ali Thanvee proudly narrates many of his mischief, one of which is as under

He narrated: Once I committed a mischief. It was a season of intermittent rains. Our charpoy were normally arranged in the veranda. Whenever it rained, we used to take them under the cover. I had lost my mother. My father, brother and my self, we three were staying in the house. Our charpoy were laid side by side in the veranda. One fine day, I quietly tied up the legs of all the charpoy firmly together with a rope. When it started raining in the night, my father tried to drag the charpoy inside the room. From whatever direction he pulled the charpoy, all the three were getting yanked

¹⁴ Ashrafus Sawaneh, by Khwaja Azizul Hasan. Published by Maktaba-e-Talifat-e-Ashrafiah, Thana Bhuvan, Muzaffarnagar, U.P. Volume 1, Chapter 5, Page 18

together. He then tried to undo the fastening. But they were so cut open the ropes, but the knife was not available in the darkness. Thus it gave a lot of trouble to him. At last, by great efforts, the legs of the charpoy were detached and they were taken in, but this entire process took quite a time and my father was totally drenched in the rains. He was very angry over the entire episode. ^{15,16}

..... خود فرماتے تھے کہ ایک دفعہ مجھے کیا شرارت سوجھی کہ برسات کا زمانہ تھا مگر ایسا کہ کبھی برس گیا، کبھی کھل گیا۔ مگر چار پائیاں باہر ہی پھرتی تھیں۔ جب برسنے لگا، چار پائیاں اندر کر لیں۔ جب کھل گیا، باہر بچھالیں۔ والدہ صاحبہ کا تو انتقال ہو چکا تھا۔ بس والد صاحب اور ہم دونوں بھائی ہی مکان میں رہتے تھے، تینوں کی چار پائیاں ملی ہوئی پھرتی تھیں۔ ایک دن میں نے چپکے سے تینوں چار پائیوں کے پائے آپس میں رسی سے خوب کس کر باندھ دئے۔ اب رات کو جو میٹھ برسنا شروع ہوا، تو والد صاحب جدھر سے بھی گھسیٹتے ہیں، تینوں کی تینوں چار پائیاں ایک ساتھ گھسیٹتی چلی آتی ہیں۔ رسیاں کھولتے ہیں تو کھلتی نہیں، کیوں کہ خوب کس کر باندھی گئی تھیں۔ کاٹنا چاہا تو چاقو نہیں ملتا۔ غرض بڑی پریشانی ہوئی اور پھر بڑی مشکل سے پائے کھل سکے۔ اور چار پائیاں اندر لے جاسکیں۔ اس میں اتنی دیر لگی کہ خوب بھیگ گئے۔ والد صاحب بڑے خفا ہوئے کہ یہ کیا نامعقول حرکت تھی۔

حوالہ نمبر: ۱ ”اشرف السوانح“ از: خواجہ عزیز الحسن، ناشر: مکتبہ تالیفات اشرفیہ، تھانہ بھون، یوپی، جلد ۱، باب ۵، ص ۱۹
حوالہ نمبر: ۲ ”الافاضات الیومیہ“ ناشر: مکتبہ دانش، دیوبند، جلد ۲، قسط ۱۰، ملفوظ ۸۳۷، ص ۴۷

The above incident is of the year 1285 AH. As we have said earlier, this was the year when Imam Ahmad Raza had already completed his studies and was busy in serving the Ummah as a full fledged Mufti and Muhaddis.

One does not know under what influence Khwaja Azizul Hasan has mentioned the above incident and what exactly he wants to suggest to the Millat-e-Islamiyah by quoting the

¹⁵ Ashrafus Sawaneh, by Khwaja Azizul Hasan. Published by Maktaba-e-Talifat-e-Ashrafiah, Thana Bhuvan, U.P. Vol. 1, Chapter 5, Page 20
¹⁶ Al Ifazat-al-Yaumiah, Published by Maktaba Deoband, Vol. 2, Chapter 10, Quote 834, page 474

above occurrence. Perhaps he wants to prove his credentials as a trusted lieutenant of Maulvi Ashraf 'Ali Thanvee and that may be the reason of his writing such a scathing episode.

2. Urination on his brother's head:

Maulvi Thanvee has himself described this event in which he had spurted urine on the head of his own brother on 17th Shawwal 1350 A.H.

“One day I was urinating when my brother reached there and urinated on my head. On the other day, when Bhai saheb was urinating, I started urinating on his head. Suddenly our father arrived there and admonished us. I said: I urinated o his head because he did the same to me the other day. My brother refuted my allegation. I was beaten up a little as I could not substantiate my charge with a proof. On the other hand, I was caught red handed while urinating on Bhai saheb. Thus, we brothers were doing all sorts of things which were beyond anybody's guess.”¹⁷

..... میں ایک روز پیشاب کر رہا تھا، بھائی صاحب نے آکر میرے سر پر پیشاب کرنا شروع کر دیا۔ ایک روز ایسا ہوا کہ بھائی صاحب پیشاب کر رہے تھے، میں نے ان کے سر پر پیشاب کرنا شروع کر دیا۔ اتفاق سے اس وقت والد صاحب تشریف لے آئے۔ فرمایا یہ کیا حرکت ہے؟ میں نے عرض کیا ایک روز انہوں نے میرے سر پر پیشاب کیا تھا۔ بھائی نے اس کا بالکل انکار کر دیا۔ مختصر پٹائی ہوئی اس لئے کہ میرا دعویٰ ہی دعویٰ رہ گیا تھا، ثبوت کچھ نہ تھا اور میرے فعل کا مشاہدہ تھا۔ غرض جو کسی کو نہ سوجھتی تھی وہ ہم دونوں بھائیوں کو سوجھتی تھی۔
حوالہ : ”الافاضات الیومیہ“ ناشر: مکتبہ دانش، دہلی (یو پی)، جلد ۲، قسط ۱۰، ملفوظ ۸۳۷، ص ۴۷۵

Those exaggerators who suggest that 'Ala Hazrat Imam Ahmad Raza and Maulvi Thanvee had studied together, should get stunned by now. This is because:

- a. Since the above incident has taken place when Maulvi Thanvee was under the training of his father, Maulvi Thanvee would have been much more than five years old (as he was under the guidance of his father, only after the year 1285 A.H. when his mother had died).

¹⁷ Al Ifazat Al Yaumiyah: Published by Maktaba-e-Deoband. Volume 2, Chapter 10, Quote 837, Page 475

- b. Further Maulvi Thanvee has described the event in a detailed fashion, (the way he made the excuse and the way he was whipped) which also proves that he would have been quite old at that time. He has described this event on 17th Shawwal 1350 A.H., when he was about 70 years old. It means that the incident was very much in his memory.

Now the question is “When did this incident take place?”

One thing is certain, that he was more than five years old at that time (for the reason that his mother had died when he was five years old). Again Maulvi Thanvee says that he does not remember the events and faces at the age of five. He even did not keep in mind the face of his mother also.

“Hazrat says that he does not recall his mother's face accurately. But when I think about it, a vague figure appears before me, who is sitting at the rear end of the charpoy. I do not remember any thing else because I was very young. What can be the capacity of 4 or 5 years!”¹⁸

Above reference demonstrates that Maulvi Thanvee does not remember the events of the age of five years. Even the face of his mother is also not clear in his mind (though this sounds amazing), then how can he recall other things? It means that his “Excretory Act” was performed by him in an older age; otherwise it would have been forgotten by him the way his mother's face had been missed. But he remembered the episode at the age of 70 and that too with the distinct remark that the act had been done with the sense of vengeance. Since his brother had drenched him with his urine, he did take the revenge. But unfortunately, just when

¹⁸ Ashrafus sawaneh: by Khwaja Azizul Hasan. Published by Maktaba-e-Talifat-e-Ashrafiah, Thana Bhuvan, U.P. Volume 1, Chapter 5, Page 18

the retaliation of “Excretion” was going on, his father arrived and observed his beloved son indulging in such a deed. Maulvi Thanvee, though defended himself by excusing that he was only following the “sunnah” of his brother, but this not deter his father from beating his son. Since Maulvi Thanvee has expressed the entire event proudly in his ‘Mehfil’, it definitely means that at the occurrence of this event he was more than five years old. If estimated roughly, he would have been at least ten years old at that time i.e. it is estimated to be occurred in the year 1290 A.H. This was 5 years later than the pronouncement of Imam Ahmad Raza as Mufti.

If we consider his age as five years at the time of urination on his brother's head, the year calculated comes out to be 1286 A.H. Here again, Imam Ahmad Raza had already concluded his studies and was pronounced as Mufti. When Maulvi Thanvee Saheb was busy in urinating on his brother's head, Imam Ahmad Raza was already a great Mufti, a learned Scholar and s trusted Muhaddis. How can thus one claim that Imam Ahmad Raza and Maulvi Thanvee had studied together?

It is claimed that prior to admission in Deoband, Maulvi Thanvee had already memorized the Holy Qur'an by hear and had become a HAFIZ. But even after memorising the Qur'an, his misadventures continued. The only difference now was, instead of normal conditions, he was busy in prankish acts during the namaz. The following incident would suffice our readers to believe that the “Hakim-ul-Ummat” of Wahabis, Maulvi Ashraf ‘Ali Thanvee, was a habitual mischief monger and that he was full of ruses and tricks right from the beginning.

3. Laughing loudly, deceiving Hafizji and breaking the namaz:

Deceiving the Hafizji and thereafter roaring out with laughter and breaking the namaz by Maulvi Thanvee is being described by his special lieutenant:

“I remember one more incident after memorizing the Qur'an. There was an old and blind Hafizji (a person who memorizes the Qur'an by heart) and was smug of his memory as regards to Qur'an. During his minor age, Hazrat used to recite the Qur'an before him (the blind Hafizji). Once on a Ramazan day, while reciting the Qur'an, Hazrat warned the Hafizji that he was going to deceive him on that particular day and also divulged him the place of ayah where he was going to confuse him. Hafizji did not pay any heed and said that many a lot of celebrities of the Qur'an have tried to deceive him before, but nobody could get succeed. In the evening when Hazrat stood to recite the Qur'an and reached at the “Innama Anta Manzar Wa Lakul Qaum-e-Haad,” he recited it in such a way that words “Allaho Ya'alam” were heard like “Allaho Akbar” and the Hafizji unintentionally went down to ruku, However, Hazrat Thanveeji went ahead with his qira'at. When poor Hafizji further heard the Qur'an, he immediately stood up and Hazratwala (i.e. Maulvi Thanvee) couldn't stop his laughter. He roared with laughter in such a way that he had to break his Namaz and go away.”¹⁹

..... اور ایک واقعہ حفظ کلام مجید کے بعد کا یاد آیا۔ ایک نابینا حافظ تھے، جن کو کلام مجید بہت پختہ یاد تھا اور اس کا ان کو ناز بھی تھا۔ ان کو حضرت والا قبل بلوغ نوافل میں کلام مجید سنایا کرتے تھے۔

ایک بار رمضان شریف میں دن کو ان سے کلام مجید کا دور کر رہے تھے، حضرت والا نے دور کے وقت ان کو متنبہ کر دیا کہ حافظ جی! میں آج تم کو دھوکہ دوں گا اور یہ بھی بتائے دیتا ہوں کہ فلاں آیت میں دھوکہ دوں گا۔ حافظ جی نے کہا کہ میاں جاؤ بھی! تم مجھے کیا دھوکہ دے سکتے ہو، بڑے بڑے حافظ تو مجھے دھوکہ دے نہ سکے۔

¹⁹ Ashrafus Sawaneh: by Khwaja Azizul Hasan. Published by Maktaba-e-Talifat-e-Ashrafiyah. Thana Bhuvan, U.P. Volume 1, Chapter 5, Page 20

حضرت والا جب سنانے کھڑے ہوئے اور اس آیت پر پہنچے ”اِنَّمَا اَنْتَ مُنْذِرٌ وَّ
لِكُلِّ قَوْمٍ هَادٍ“ بہت ترتیل کے ساتھ پڑھا جیسا کہ رکوع کرنے کے قریب حضرت والا کا
معمول ہے۔ اس کے بعد اس سے آگے جب اللّٰهُ يَعْلَمُ الْخَبْرَ پڑھنے لگے تو لفظ ”اللّٰهُ“ کو اس
طرح بڑھا کر پڑھا کہ جیسے رکوع میں جارہے ہوں اور تکبیر یعنی اللہ اکبر کہنے والے ہوں۔ بس
حافظ جی یہ سمجھ کر کہ رکوع میں جارہے ہیں فوراً رکوع میں چلے گئے۔ ادھر حضرت والا نے آگے
قرأت شروع کر دی۔ يَعْلَمُ مَا تَحْمِلُ الْخَبْرَ اب ادھر حافظ جی تو رکوع میں پہنچے اور ادھر
حضرت والا نے آگے قرأت شروع کر دی۔ فوراً ہی حافظ جی سیدھے ہو کر کھڑے ہوئے۔ اس پر
حضرت والا کو بے اختیار ہنسی آگئی۔ اور قبضہ مار کر ہنس پڑے۔ اور ہنسی سے اس قدر مغلوب ہوئے
کہ نماز توڑ کر الگ ہو گئے۔

حوالہ : ”اشرف السوانح“ از: خواجہ عزیز الحسن، ناشر: مکتبہ تالیفات اشرفیہ، تھانہ بہون (یوپی)

جلد ۱، باب ۵، ص ۲۰

Those who insist upon determining that Maulvi Thanvee and Imam Ahmad Raza were studying together, should at least now know that when Maulvi Thanvee had not been even admitted into the Darul-Uloom Deoband and was busy in praying the ‘Deceiving Namaz’. Imam Ahmad Raza was quenching the thirst of Islamic world with his knowledge of ‘Deen’ or religion. Compare the two personalities and one can distinctly confirm that both of them cannot be and were not co-students.

Above incident exhibits that Maulvi Thanvee had pre-planned his mischief and he was so sure of his art of deceit, that he had warned the Hafizji in advance about his maneuver. Hafizji was having faith in his own memory and therefore challenged him as an honest Hafiz. However the poor old blind man was not aware that the person to whom he is rebutting is not an ordinary deceiver, but the ‘Leader of the Deceivers’ and hence ultimately he had to give in.

Now let's have a look at the namaz of Maulvi Thanvee. Though he was reciting the Qur'an, his mind was busy in

planning to deceive the Hafizji. Mentally he was preoccupied with the ayah on which he had plotted to humiliate Hafizji and the moment he reached on that particular spot, he recited it treacherously and poor old blind man had to go to ruku.

Further, have a look at the status of Maulvi Thanvee as Imam. He was standing ahead of all the other namazees. In ordinary course, being an imam one could never know what is being done behind him. He has to concentrate on the place of sajdah. But here, Maulvi Thanvee very well knew about what was happening at his rear and hence when Hafizji was deceived by him, he burst into laughter. He also noticed the Hafizji re-erecting himself and was so happy with his art of cheating that he broke his namaz and went away.

The “Hakim-ul-Ummat” of Wahabis, showed his ‘Hikmat’ (cunningness) during the most important prayer of Islam, i.e. namaz. Every Muslim is supposed to respect and regard the honour of namaz. Even the non-Muslims show their respect when a Muslim is offering the namaz. This can be experienced in a train journey when a Muslim wants to offer the namaz; other non-Muslims present their seats and keep silence with esteem. Alas! ‘Hakim-ul-Ummat’ couldn't be compared even with non-Muslims. Because here was a person who had the treasure of 30 parts of the Holy Qur'an hidden under his chest, and was engaged in making FUN of the namaz. He thought of acting upon a trick and that too during the namaz and in the Quranic Ayah!

I have used the term ‘Leader of the Deceivers’ for Maulvi Thanvee. This term may not be liked by some of the readers. Hence I quote below one more trickery of Maulvi Thanvee just to strengthen my claim about his ‘Utopian’ art of cheating. Says Khwaja Azizul Hasan:

“Hazrat always used to keep the beads (Tasbeeh) in his hands whenever he was free and at times used to say amusingly: I have termed these beads as a trap, because mainly people are incarcerated through his snare only.”²⁰

..... حضرت اقدس کسی کام سے فارغ ہوتے ہی فوراً تسبیح سنبھالتے تھے اور
بعض اوقات مزاحاً فرماتے کہ میں نے اس کا نام ”جال“ رکھا ہے کیونکہ اسی سے لوگ پھنستے ہیں۔
حوالہ : ”خاتمۃ السوانح“ از: خواجہ عزیز الحسن، ناشر: مکتبۃ تالیفات اشرفیہ، تھانا بھون، بار دوم، ص ۴۸

Without adding any commentary regarding the above excerpt, I further mention below another strange but abhorring spectacle of Maulvi Thanveeji.

“Once a Dervish (Saint) came here and fed his disciples lot of bread, to the extent of going under debt of Rs.6000/. He said to me that he had anticipated that his followers would contribute generously, but they didn't. Hence he requested me to write a letter of recommendation to the president of a certain state to give him a loan of the wanted amount. As a matter of courtesy I obliged him. But, in order to avoid burdening the president I posted a letter separately to him saying that if anybody brings any reference letter form me, not to pay heed to it and act according to the situation. Thus there would not have been any for him on my behalf and he was free to act according to his own discrimination.”^{21,22}

Before analysing the above event, I shall quote one more similar incident, proudly described by Maulvi Thanvee among his followers representing his fraudulent attitude.

²⁰ Khatama-tus-Sawaneh, by Khwaja Azizul Hasan. Published by Maktaba-e-Talifat-e-Ashrafiah, Thana Bhuvan, U.P. 2nd edition, page 48

²¹ Husn-al-Aziz, by Hakim Muhammad Bijnori, Published by Maktaba-e-Talifat-e-Ashrafiah, Thana Bhuvan, U.P. Volume 3, Part 1, Chapter 12, Page 102

²² Kamalat-e-Ashrafiah: (1995) A collection of sayings and excerpts of Maulvi Thanvee, Published by Maktaba-e-Talifat-e-Ashrafiah, Thana Bhuvan, Muzaffarpur, U.P. Chapter 1, Quotation 603, page 142

“Some people force me to write letters of recommendation for them. I advise them to prepare the content for such letters as they want me to conform. I simply copy it and sent it to oblige them. But immediately I send a card by post, following the above reference letter and ask them not to take notice of my such and such letter and it would not be obligatory for you to act upon it.”^{23,24}

Please go through the above stances again and again, and praise the fraudulent demeanour of Maulvi Thanvee. The first instance where he described the beads as the ‘trap’ for the people to snare them yells at the charlatan attitude of Maulvi Thanvee. Beads are the unanimous symbol of piety in all religions and are used to repeat the prayers of a particular faith. But Maulvi Thanvee had used it as if he was ready with the trap of beads in his hands and calling everybody “O come here and get caged.” Do the members of Tablighee Jama’at keep the Beads in their hands for the purpose of snaring the people only?

In the second and the third instances, Maulvi Thanvee himself admits that he deceives the people who come to seek any help from him. A dervish was under the debt of 6000/- and asked for his letter of re-commendation. He obliged him and the poor dervish went away with all the hopes of a solution to his financial problems. He might have reached to the ruler of the state with thousands of difficulties only to know that the recommendation letter given to him was of no value. Because as soon as the dervish departed away from Maulvi Thanvee's presence, he had, under the influence of his cheating attitude, written another letter to the ruler nullifying the contents of his earlier letter of recommendation.

Dear readers! Please decide yourselves whether it had been fair to inform the dervish in advance only that his appeal cannot be supplemented. What was the need to give him false hope? Did Maulvi Thanvee sahib not enact the role of a

²³ Husn-al-Aziz, Published by Maktaba-e-Talifat-e-Ashrafiah, Thana Bhuvan, U.P. Volume 2, Part 2, Chapter 15, Quote 138, Page 23

²⁴ Kamalat-e-Ashrafiah: published by Maktaba-e-Talifat-e-Ashrafiah, Thana Bhuvan, U.P. in the year 1995. Chapter 2, Quote 50, Page 325

clever politician who promises something at the face but fails to deliver behind one's back? Does Islam teach these tenets? Can a person with such character be regarded as a Mujaddid of Islam?

Some blind followers of Maulvi Thanvee have staked the claim that the said dervish was compelling Maulvi Thanvee to render a recommendation letter and that just to get rid of him, he had opted for such a recourse. Whereas the facts witness that this was not the exceptional incident in the life of Maulvi Thanvee. It was his routine habit to oblige people on their faces and than to write secretly about nullification of his letters of recommendations. He was sadist by nature and was occupied in wasting the time, energy and resources of the people around him. His biography is full of such incidents where he can be observed as a master cheater and deceiver.

We are discussing here weather Imam Ahmad Raza and Maulvi Thanvee had studied together or not. In this connection we have provided to our readers ample historical facts to conclude that they have not. When right from his young age, Imam Ahmad Raza was being acknowledged as a great servant of Islam by all the Ulemas of the world through his deeds, through his pen and his lectures, Maulvi Thanvee was engaged in executing atrocious mischief of his childhood. Even when he reached at the old age of 70, he did not forget his misdeeds and as a matter of pride, he used to describe them to his followers.

4. Throwing the shoes of worshipers on the mandap of the mosque:

Maulvi Thanvee himself describes the events as under:

“Once in Meerut, in the mosque adjoining Late Mian Ilahi Baksh's house, I collected all the shoes of the namazees and threw them away on to the tent-like extension to the mosque. All the namazees started shouting for their shoes. One person then pointed out the location of the shoes, but no one told me anything. This was Allah's blessing that despite committing all this mischief, nobody hurt me.

It would be said as:

You get angry over love
 I get love over anger
 This is all from Allah; otherwise these are the deeds which can earn
 one a sound beating.”²⁵

..... ایک مرتبہ میرٹھ میں میاں الہی بخش صاحب مرحوم کی کوٹھی میں جو مسجد ہے،
 سب نمازیوں کے جوتے جمع کر کے اس کے شامیانے پر بھینک دیئے۔ نمازیوں میں غل مچا کہ
 جوتے کیا ہوئے۔ ایک شخص نے کہا کہ یہ لٹک رہے ہیں، مگر کسی نے کچھ نہ کہا، یہ خدا کا فضل تھا۔
 باوجود ان حرکتوں کے اذیت کسی نے نہیں پہنچائی۔ وہی قصہ رہا جیسا کہ کسی نے کہا ہے۔
 تم کو آتا ہے پیار پر غصہ
 ہم کو غصہ پہ پیارا آتا ہے
 یہ سب اللہ کی طرف سے ہے، ورنہ ایسی حرکتوں پر پٹائی ہوا کرتی ہے۔
 حوالہ : ’’الافاضات الیومیہ‘‘ ناشر: مکتبہ دانش، دیوبند (پوٹی) جلد ۲، قسط ۱۰، ملفوظ ۸۳، ص ۷۵

In the above ‘deed’, Maulvi Thanvee thanks Allah ﷻ and says that “This is all from Allah ﷻ; otherwise these are deeds which can earn one a sound beating.” He wants to suggest that all such atrocities committed by him were from Allah ﷻ, and although according to him all such things is worth punishment. While trying to prove the approval of his devoutness in the court of Allah ﷻ, and to suggest that Allah ﷻ rescues His devotees, Maulvi Thanvee has forgotten that the devotees of Allah ﷻ do not throw the shoes of ‘slaves of Allah ﷻ’ away and tease them. Instead, they feel happiness in serving them and would try to protect their shoes from theft etc. furthermore, in his old age; he has described such misdeeds with pride. What kind of lesson did he want to teach his followers?

5. Placing a puppy in the plate of his uncle:

Maulvi Thanvee relates one more incident as under:

“There was a person who happened to be the brother of my step-mother. He was an honest and simple man. My father had appointed

²⁵ Al Ifazat al Yaumiyah, Published by Maktaba-e-Danish, Deoband, U.P. Vol. 2, Chapter 10, Quote 837, Page 475

him as contractor. Once, in the summer, he returned from the commisionerate dreadfully hungry and thirsty and taking out the food he started eating it. There was a market in front of the house. I picked up a puppy from the road and quietly placed it in the plate from which he was eating his food. The poor chap left the bread and promptly stood up, but he did not say a single word to me.”²⁶

..... ایک صاحب تھے سیکری کے ہمارے سوتیلی والدہ کے بھائی۔ بہت ہی نیک اور سادہ آدمی تھے۔ والد صاحب نے ان کو ٹھیکہ کے کام پر رکھ چھوڑا تھا۔ ایک مرتبہ کمریٹ سے گرمی میں بھوکے پیاسے پریشان گھر آئے اور کھانا نکال کر کھانے میں مشغول ہوئے۔ گھر کے سامنے بازار ہے۔ میں نے سڑک پر سے ایک کتے کا پلڈہ چھوٹا سا پلڈہ رکھ لاکر ان کی دال کی رکابی میں رکھ دیا۔ بے چارے روٹی چھوڑ کر کھڑے ہو گئے اور کچھ نہیں کہا۔
حوالہ : ”الافاضات الیومیہ“ ناشر: مکتبہ دانش، دیوبند (یو پی) جلد ۲، قسط ۱۰، ملفوظ ۳۷، ص ۵۷

Maulvi Thanvee's mother had died in the year 1285 A.H. when he was 5 years old. By that time Imam Ahmad Raza had already concluded all the knowledge of religion. After the death of Maulvi Thanvee's mother, his father had married another woman, who had a step brother. According to Maulvi Thanvee, this gentleman was not only a simple person. But his uncle very well in his old age of 70 also. Hence it is certain that the above incident had taken place well after 1285 A.H. when his mother had died. Otherwise he would not have remembered it the way he did not remember his mother's face. But he specifically recalls that his Uncle was eating in a plate and that he had put a puppy in his plate. He also recalls that there was a market in front of his house and that he had caught hold of the puppy from the road thereat. This again ascertains that the above incident had taken place much after 1285 A.H.

I would like to place before the readers one more reference of the incident of fastening the legs of charpoys by Thanvee. This incident is also written in “Al Ifazat al Yaumiya”, Vol. 2, Chapter 10, quote 837, page 474. Here it is further

²⁶ Al Ifazat al Yaumiya: Published by Maktaba-e-Danish, Deoband, U.P. Vol. 2, Chapter 10, Quote 837, Page 475

written that Maulvi Thanvee says that “I do not remember if anybody had beaten me for this act or not.”

Thanvee did not remember his mother's face; he did not remember whether anybody had beaten him for fastening the legs of charpoys; but he very well remembered the placing of puppy in his uncle's plate. Therefore it is very explicit that the above incident has taken place very well after the year 1285 A.H. It was a time when Imam Raza was shining like a sun on the sky of the Islamic world of scholars and thinkers. Then to suggest that Maulvi Thanvee and Imam Raza were studying together is a blatant lie and deserves no attention at all.

Conclusion:

In short, even to think that Imam Ahmad Raza and Maulvi Thanvee had studied together is an arrant fabrication. Because when Imam Ahmad Raza was at the peak of his name and fame in the field of Islamic and worldly knowledge, Maulvi Thanvee was preoccupied with his childish mischief and misdeeds like an ordinary child. e.g.

1. Maulvi Thanvee had fastened the legs of charpoys of his father resulting in his father getting drenched in the rains.
2. Maulvi Thanvee had urinated on the head of his brother and was punished by his father for this act.
3. In the mosque of Mian Ilahi Baksh, Maulvi Thanvee had thrown away the shoes of namazees.
4. Maulvi Thanvee had placed a puppy in the plate of his simple and pious uncle.

After all such debates and proofs, does there still exist any claim that Imam Ahmad Raza and Maulvi Thanvee had studied together? No, it is impossible. There is no question of both of them studying together.

While concluding the booklet, I simply wish to say that:

“Had you not hurt us, we would not have complained such. Neither the secrets would have been opened, nor the insults inflicted.”